Facing the Challenge: Indonesia’s Continuing Journey in Improving Teacher Quality and Equity

Nina Sardjunani
Deputy Minister for Human Resources and Cultural Affairs
MINISTRY OF NATIONAL DEVELOPMENT PLANNING
The Big Questions

Is there an inherent tradeoff between education quality and equity?

Is there a direct link between the size of funding to an education sector and its performance?
Low average performance
Large socio-economic disparities

High average performance
Large socio-economic disparities

High average performance
High social equity

Socially equitable distribution of learning opportunities

Strong socio-economic impact on student performance

Low reading performance
Durchschnittliche Schülerleistungen im Bereich Mathematik

Low average performance
Large socio-economic disparities

High average performance
High social equity

Strong socio-economic impact on student performance

High reading performance

2009

Source: OECD
Durchschnittliche Schülerleistungen im Bereich Mathematik

Low average performance
Large socio-economic disparities

High average performance
High social equity

Strong socio-economic impact on student performance

Socially equitable distribution of learning opportunities

High reading performance

Low reading performance

Source: OECD
# Different Interventions for Different Stages

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Prescribed intervention</th>
<th>Poor</th>
<th>Fair</th>
<th>Good</th>
<th>Great</th>
<th>Excellent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Central control over system</td>
<td>Fulfill basic student needs</td>
<td>More school autonomy</td>
<td>More school accountability</td>
<td>Higher accountability and continuing professional development for teachers</td>
<td>Schools leading reform Teachers driving innovation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bring schools to minimum quality threshold</td>
<td>Scaffolding for low-skill teachers</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: McKinsey, World Bank, OECD
How Big is Indonesia’s Education System?
How Big is Indonesia’s Education System?

• 2.7 million teachers under MONE, 700,000 more under MORA—historically received low remuneration
• Over 230,000 primary, junior secondary, and senior secondary schools
• Spread across over 500 districts, 33 provinces, 13,000 islands
• Different developmental stages across districts
• Although steadily improving, still scores relatively low in PISA and TIMMS, yet is consistently high performing in Int’l Science Olympiads
Interventions with Potential: International Experience

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Interventions with Potential(^1)</th>
<th>Teacher Quality</th>
<th>Teacher Equity</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Improve teacher quality and make them more accountable</td>
<td>☻</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Improve equity by ensuring effective distribution, employment and deployment of teachers</td>
<td></td>
<td>☻</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Improve pre-service teacher training and intake process</td>
<td>☻</td>
<td>☻</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\(^1\) See for instance *Transforming Indonesia’s Teaching Force* (World Bank, 2010); *How the World’s Most Improved Schools Systems Keep Getting Better* (McKinsey & Co., 2010); and OECD’s PISA Reports
Indonesia: Improve Teacher Quality & Accountability

With **certification**, teachers receive higher pay, but with strings attached:

- Performance Appraisal
- Continuing Professional Development
- Career Progression & Promotion
Indonesia: Improve Teacher Quality & Accountability

- Internet
- School
- Performance Appraisal
- Continuing Professional Development
- Career Progression & Promotion
- Block grants to teacher working groups
- BOS (per-student financing)
- Doubling teacher salary

College
Working groups
Indonesia: Improve Equity by Effective Distribution of Teachers

- Doubling teacher salary
- Special location allowance
- 24hr/week minimum teaching requirement
- Teacher distribution; employment/deployment
Indonesia: Improve Equity by Effective Distribution of Teachers

- Doubling teacher salary
- Teacher distribution; employment/deployment
- Special location allowance
- Pre-service training: closer link to school
- 24hr/week minimum teaching requirement
- Teacher distribution; employment/deployment
Indonesia: Improve Pre-service Training

- Pre-service training: closer link to school
- Teacher training college reform (MONE)
- Scholarships (central & local government)
Indonesia: Improve Pre-service Training

Pre-service training: closer link to school

Teacher training college reform (MONE)

Scholarships (central & local government)
Indonesia: Building More Effective Teachers

- Pre-service training: closer link to school
- Teacher training college reform (MONE)
- Scholarships (central & local government)
- Internet
- School
- College
- Working groups
- Continuing Professional Development
- Performance appraisal
- Career Progression & Promotion
- Block grants to teacher working groups
- BOS (per-student financing)
- Doubling teacher salary
- Special location allowance
- 24 hr/week minimum teaching requirement
- Teacher distribution; employment/deployment
- Teacher distribution; employment/deployment
- Block grants to teacher working groups
- BOS (per-student financing)
- Doubling teacher salary
- Special location allowance
- 24 hr/week minimum teaching requirement
- Teacher distribution; employment/deployment
Progress in Indonesia

• Real progress in education reform is usually not visible until years, even decades

• The new teacher performance appraisal, career progression, and continuing professional development will be rolled out nationally by 2013
Progress in Indonesia

• But some progress have been noted:
  – Since revitalization of teacher working groups, teachers are beginning to implement more interactive teaching methods in the classroom
  – Several certified teachers are already using their increased pay to get access to professional development, e.g. buying laptops, modems, books and modules
  – In District of Gorontalo, massive teacher redistribution has taken place—District Education Office reported increased willingness to work in remote areas
  – Since teacher certification and doubling of salary, teacher training colleges report significant increase in number and quality of applicants; national-scale study is underway
Challenges Still Lie Ahead

Improving Teacher Quality & Accountability

- Still relatively low capacity of: (i) facilitators at working groups, and (ii) principals as performance assessors
- Need to establish quality assurance system for performance appraisal
- How to manage chronically underperforming teachers

Improving Teacher Equity

- Resistance from teachers to be redeployed to remote areas

Improving Pre-service Training

- Training colleges lack skills and experience to link up and manage relationship with partner schools
- No incentive structure for experienced teachers to mentor trainees
What Other Systems Can Learn from Indonesia’s Experience

• Intervention themes may be the same, but need to adopt to developmental stage and country’s specific context
• Good incentive structure must be coupled with reliable accountability system
• School’s role takes center stage—strong support and capacity building is imperative
• Keep an eye on the money—e.g., an unchecked progression trend may potentially lead to too many senior-level teachers, which would put an additional burden on the state budget